

The Smithfield Board of Historic and Architectural Review held its regular meeting on Tuesday, June 19th, 2018. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. Members present were Mr. Trey Gwaltney, Chairman; Mr. Russell Hill, Mr. David Goodrich, and Mr. Ronny Prevatte. Mr. Gary Hess, Mr. Chris Torre, and Ms. Julia Hillegass were absent. The staff members present were Mr. Joseph R. Reish, Planning Technician and Mr. William H. Riddick III, Town Attorney. There were six citizens present. The media was not represented.

Chairman Gwaltney – I would like to welcome everyone to the June meeting of the Board of Historic and Architectural Review. The first item on our agenda is the Planning Technician's Report.

Planning Technician – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have two items to report tonight. At 132 Main Street the new "Sew Personal Boutique" was given administrative approval for a new detached sign. At 216 Cary Street administrative approval was given to replace the porch decking with like materials, colors, and styles.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is the Upcoming Meetings and Activities. The list is provided for you to review. The next item on the agenda is Public Comments. We have a few people signed up for public comments.

Mrs. Betty Clark – I live at 120 North Church Street. I cannot understand how this board can call itself the Board of Historic and Architectural Review. Members of this board obviously have not bothered to read the town ordinances or have been told to let the Wombwell house burn. Mr. Saunders told the newspaper when the property was purchased that the house was in good enough shape to keep up. The town has let the Wombwell house decline. The board tells other people that they must keep up historic property yet the town is allowed to ignore its responsibility. Isn't this situation a double standard? What is going to happen to the graves on the property? The house is at least one hundred and seventy-five years old. It doesn't matter if the town has squandered money on other projects. The board needs to do its job and protect this house before the fire department burns it on Olden Days. How ironic it is that a salvageable old property is scheduled for obliteration on Olden Days. It is the town's obligation to take care of its history. We beg you to do so.

Town Attorney – Mrs. Clark, you are welcome to the house. We have offered it to anyone who would take it. Nobody wants it.

Mrs. Clark – That is not the issue.

Town Attorney – That is the issue. That is the final say.

Chairman Gwaltney – I believe the house is outside of our jurisdiction.

Town Attorney – It is not in the historic district.

Chairman Gwaltney – I would bet that none of us on the board want to see any historic building demolished. We didn't have the opportunity to vote on anything about the property. The board has no more power to do anything than the six of you as the general public. As the Chairman I appreciate your comments. I agree with your comments. I hate to see the building demolished.

Ms. Margaret Thompson – At 333 Main Street I have a shop called the “French Country Monkey”. I also own family property at 15100 Mt Holly Creek Lane in Smithfield. One of the reasons why I wanted to move my shop here because it says on the water tower Ham, Hospitality, and History. Many towns and big cities are probably very sorry that they have allowed old buildings to be torn down instead of being restored. Who can do something about this? Once it is done it is over with it.

Chairman Gwaltney – You are correct. I have made the recorded comment before when the bulldozers are gone it is over.

Ms. Thompson – It is too late then.

Chairman Gwaltney – We understand. I would think someone representing the town either Mr. Riddick or Mr. Reish can answer your question after the meeting about who you can talk to directly or what else can be done? A lot has been done to try to find a new owner, better location, all of these things for the building. I was involved with the initial RFP where they were trying to find buyers. I went through the house to see if there was anything I could suggest to do with it.

Mr. Hill – I walked through the house with the sister of the man that owned the house originally. Her granddaughter approached me about moving the house. We were going to disassemble it and put it on tractor trailer to carry it to Charlottesville. But by the time we did all the numbers it was so costly for her to move it. When it comes to money it is too expensive for anyone to do anything with it.

Mrs. Robbie Younger – I live at 1900 Farm Road. I also own 324 Main Street, The Painted Garden Gallery. I am in agreement with the two ladies. I think it is very sad. I have been here for eighteen years. I would like history to be more on the forefront of things. I hope in the future if there is something more that we can do that we all do it.

Chairman Gwaltney - Next is Board Member Comments. Next on the agenda is New Construction – 228 Clay Street – Contributing – Andrea Agle and Ryan Cere, applicants.

Planning Technician – Perhaps it should have been reclassified as Non-Contributing.

Chairman Gwaltney – It is a vacant lot.

Planning Technician – Ms. Agle and Mr. Cere are not able to attend tonight.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are there any comments from the board?

Planning Technician – Would you like for me to give a quick report?

Chairman Gwaltney – I'm sorry I should have done that.

Planning Technician – Ms. Agle and Mr. Cere could not attend tonight because of a family matter that came up. At the last meeting they were given approval to demolish the old house at 228 Clay Street which was in really bad shape. They were also given approval to construct a new single family dwelling in conformity with what was presented. The roof siding, the two types of siding, and shutters have not changed. However, the soffit will be a LP Smart Siding brand that is vented and white in color. The fascia board will be wood and painted white in color. Although the windows are the same vinyl double hung six over six grid pattern, the window trim will be a 1" x 4" PVC, white in color. On the front porch there was some concern about the stone veneer. It is going to be predominantly the "Spring Creek" color which is the darker stone veneer with a little bit of the lighter one mixed in randomly for contrast. The rendering is as close as he could get to what he wants it to be for the stone veneer. He wants to put the grout in it if it will allow for it.

Mr. Goodrich – In your report under windows it says six over six grid pattern but if you go over to the page that they submitted it says one over one grid pattern. I would like to have that clarified whether that is what they want or not?

Planning Technician – I believe at the last meeting it was clarified. Perhaps I left six over six on there not meaning to.

Chairman Gwaltney – I remember some comments about that looking more colonial and the one over one looking more craftsman.

Mr. Goodrich – I thought so but I couldn't remember.

Planning Technician – On page ten of the last meeting minutes, Mr. Gwaltney mentioned that the picture of the windows were one over one. Mr. Hess and you both agreed that the one over one was a more appropriate style.

Mr. Goodrich – That is alright if you cannot find it. My vote tonight would be whether we approve it or not it should be a one over one grid pattern instead of a six over six. Because one over one looks better with that style house. We were not entirely satisfied with the type of material that he was going to use for the stone. Is there a change to that?

Planning Technician – He clarified it a little bit. This application has a little bit more information. It is ideal for exterior wall covering. The type that he wants is in the middle section of the packet where it says “Spring Creek”. It is the darker one with a few of the lighter ones mixed in with it. Similar to what the rendering shows right above that. He also wants to put the grout in it.

Mr. Goodrich – There was a lot of discussion that night about the product that he wanted to use. It is not going to stand up to the weather. It is mainly an indoor product. I remember the name “Spring Creek” was the exact name that he used when he talked about the stone. It is supposed to be used on the interior. If it is two different products that have the same name that is what is confusing me.

Planning Technician – I am not sure if it is the same product or a different one. I certainly hope whatever he uses holds up if it is approved. Otherwise he may be looking at a violation one day if it starts falling off.

Mr. Goodrich – Mr. Hill, will the LP Smart Siding product hold up as well as Hardie?

Mr. Hill – Yes. It is basically the same product but it is a lot more expensive.

Mr. Goodrich – Does it have any cement?

Mr. Hill – No.

Planning Technician – Is it a wood epoxy mix?

Mr. Hill – Yes. It is about forty percent higher than Hardie in price. I know Hardie works. I use it a lot.

Mr. Goodrich – I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented with the amendment that the windows be approved with one over one.

Mr. Hill – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney - A motion has been made and properly seconded to approve the application as presented with the amendment that the windows be approved with one over one. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, four members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is a Color Change – 390 South Church Street – Contributing – Catherine Cooper, applicant. Can we have a staff report?

Planning Technician – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It is going to be a color change on the siding at 390 South Church Street. The siding is currently yellow and she proposes to paint it a sage color. The window trim is currently white and she proposes to paint it yellow. The shutters are currently green and she proposes a darker color called “Raisin”.

Chairman Gwaltney - Do we have anyone here to speak on behalf of this application?

Ms. Catherine Cooper – I live at 390 South Church Street. The yellow is currently falling off.

Mr. Goodrich – I think it that would be a great improvement to the look of the house.

Mr. Prevatte – The colors are very complimentary.

Mr. Goodrich – The paint is coming off in sheets.

Mr. Prevatte – You have to use primer.

Mr. Goodrich – I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented.

Mr. Hill – When you paint the window trim yellow is the sash going to stay white?

Ms. Cooper – What is the sash?

Mr. Hill – Are you going to paint the frame around the windows yellow and the sash is going to stay white?

Ms. Cooper – Yes.

Mr. Hill – How about the columns on the front porch?

Ms. Cooper – They will be white.

Mr. Hill – All the front porch columns and the sash is going to stay white?

Ms. Cooper – Yes.

Mr. Prevatte – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney - A motion has been made and properly seconded to approve the application as presented. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, four members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is Color Change, Siding Change, Garage Door Change, and add Shutters – 229 Cary Street – Contributing – W. Lee Duncan, applicant. Can we have a staff report?

Planning Technician – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would like to clarify that the color change is on the house. The shutters are going to be added to the house. The siding and doors are going to be on the garage. Unfortunately this is after the fact so there are some pictures of what Mr. Duncan has done so far. Basically everything on the house was painted white. The columns have been painted a tan color called “Stone Lion” along with the trim. One interesting thing when the aluminum siding was pulled off it showed the original window trim. As part of the ongoing restoration process he wants to change the colors and add shutters to the house. The garage is currently a plywood faced garage where the whole front of it is just plywood. He wants to basically duplicate the siding that is on the side and rear which it is a pine lap. He would like to paint it white and add two carriage doors to the two wider doors on the garage. He wants to make the shutters out of real wood and paint them green.

Chairman Gwaltney - Are you constructing them?

Mr. Duncan – No.

Mr. Prevatte – The property at Benns Church that sits off the road has slow growth pine on it.

Chairman Gwaltney - Do we have anyone here to speak on behalf of this application?

Mr. Lee Duncan – I live at 12170 Modest Neck Road, Ivor. There were shutters on the front two windows on the oldest section of the house. We would like to put on green louver shutters. We have administrative approval to pull off the aluminum siding on the front of the house which was white. When I tore off the aluminum siding it ripped

the ends off the window sills and tore off the drip cap along the top of the windows.

Once I tore off the aluminum siding and starting replacing the wood on the rotted areas I thought I would love to paint this right now. I will just paint it off white and change the columns slightly for some contrast. I accept responsibility for not getting it approved. We just want to put it back the way it was when it was first built.

Chairman Gwaltney – Mr. Duncan, have you ever looked at a project and said wow I would love to do that three months from now?

Mr. Duncan – That would require planning.

Chairman Gwaltney – It would require planning and waiting.

Planning Technician – I mentioned to Mr. Duncan that his artistic ability does not always go well with the bureaucratic process.

Mr. Duncan – I am getting better though. I will use the old wooden louver shutters.

Mr. Goodrich – My comment is not to deride Mr. Duncan at all. The Education Committee is in the process of developing educational materials. If we are going to hold people responsible by educating them that they need to come to us first. There is a process and if somebody sees that the process wasn't followed in this instance then how can we hold them responsible for the process later on. We want to encourage people not to do the work before they receive approval. If you look at my old house on Church Street the beautiful green door is now a bright blue. The owner never asked the board if she could paint the door that color. If we tell her that door should have not been painted blue it is the same situation that we have here.

Chairman Gwaltney – I think your comments are well made. Not knowing at this point how to truly enforce after the fact applications. I would recommend the committee to work on some of these things as you talk about how to educate people that there is a process to follow.

Mr. Duncan – Mr. Reish lives right next door. Mr. Reish told me I was in violation. I respect what all of you do. I know I operate sometimes outside the rules. I accept whatever requirements are made if I have to paint it white again then I will paint it white. I totally respect the board's decision.

Mr. Prevatte – Mr. Reish, do you have the authority to approve colors?

Planning Technician – Not a color change. The only thing our office can approve administratively is if you are repairing or rebuilding using the same styles, colors, and

materials. We can administratively approve removing things such as aluminum or vinyl siding. In Mr. Duncan's case he had white aluminum siding and removed it to expose the original white wood siding. It would be the same color and style it is just different material. That is a minor thing that we can administratively approve. The only color change that we can administratively approve if it is in the rear of the house and cannot be seen from the road. If you can see if from the road, a change in style, color, or material, it has to come before the board for approval.

Chairman Gwaltney – The two major portions of the house may have not been painted would be the porch decking and ceiling because I cannot see it in the pictures.

Mr. Duncan – I painted the porch ceiling. It was sort of a faded blue green but now it is a brighter sky blue color.

Planning Technician – There was no color change.

Chairman Gwaltney – I don't think you have painted the porch deck.

Mr. Duncan – I have not.

Chairman Gwaltney – Did you repaint the roof?

Mr. Duncan – I painted the roof the same silver color.

Chairman Gwaltney – The only reason I am saying all this is so we as a board can get a clear picture of what has been done at this point.

Mr. Duncan – I am not changing the color on the porch just touching it up. The porch ceiling is a brighter blue now. I took off the aluminum storm door and touched it up. We took all the storm windows off and touched up all the sashes in a brighter white. We painted the fascia board, columns, and the trim around the windows the taupe color to give it contrast. We didn't change the roof color.

Planning Technician – What year was it built?

Mr. Duncan – I think it was around "1913". The road was put in before that. It had been part of the original farmstead.

Planning Technician – It is a very heavily traveled road.

Mr. Goodrich – I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented.

Mr. Prevatte – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney - A motion has been made and properly seconded to approve the application as presented. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, four members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Mr. Duncan – The ladies before me had wonderful points about the Wombell house. I walked through it. I am sentimental about history. The town could not find a use. There were no prospective buyers. It would cost about \$30,000.00 or more to move it. If you could chain yourself to the house or petition people to integrate it into the sports complex to use as an office or storage facility of some kind. I know it is late. It is a beautiful house but it is in the wrong place at the wrong time.

Chairman Gwaltney – When he says it is really a shame that we are losing this property you are hearing it from someone who knows about this stuff and who cares about it. I think your comment is very well made. It is in the wrong place at the wrong time.

Ms. Younger – I understand what he is saying. I know he has done a lot in the community we all appreciate that. I also believe Ms. Clark has done a lot. I believe her opinion is very valuable in our community also.

Chairman Gwaltney – Do you have anything to say about the committee?

Mr. Goodrich – The committee was not able to meet before this meeting. Mr. Riddick, do we have to advertise if the education committee has a meeting?

Town Attorney – All you have to do is call the Town Manager's office and they will post a notice that you are going to meet at a certain time and place. That is all that is required. If there is more than two of you.

Mr. Goodrich – Thank you.

Planning Technician – How much notice do we have to give?

Town Attorney – I think a week is sufficient.

Chairman Gwaltney - Next on the agenda is an Approval of the May 15, 2018 Meeting minutes.

Town Attorney – I found some minor typographical and syntax errors. I have fixed those and would recommend the minutes be approved as revised.

Mr. Hill – So moved.

Mr. Goodrich – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney - A motion has been made and properly seconded to approve the minutes as revised. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, four members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Our meeting is adjourned.

The meeting adjourned at 7:19 p.m.

Mr. Trey Gwaltney
Chairman

Mr. Joseph Reish
Planning Technician