

The Smithfield Board of Historic and Architectural Review held its regular meeting on Tuesday, November 21<sup>st</sup>, 2017. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. Members present were Mr. Trey Gwaltney, Chairman; Mr. Russell Hill, Mr. David Goodrich, Mr. Ronny Prevatte, and Mr. Gary Hess. Ms. Hillegass and Mr. Torre were absent. The staff members present were Mr. Joseph Reish, Planning Technician and Mr. William H. Riddick III, Town Attorney. There were approximately twelve (12) citizens present. The media was not represented.

Chairman Gwaltney – I would like to welcome everyone to the November meeting of the Board of Historic and Architectural Review. The first item on our agenda is the Planning Technician's Report.

Planning Technician – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have several items to report. At 322 Main Street, which is on the agenda tonight, we gave a waiver to Mr. Oszust to repaint the building the same color. He wants to do some other restoration to it. It is going to be the same color, material, and style. We administratively approved a sign at 210 Main Street for Stalling and Associates. It was for window logos. I wanted to remind the board that we have a Board of Zoning Appeals meeting tonight at 7:30 p.m.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next item on the agenda is Upcoming Meetings and Activities. There is a list provided for you to review. Next on the agenda is Public Comments. We have no one signed up for public comments. Next on the agenda is Board Member Comments. Are there any board member comments? Next is a Porch Railings – 322 Main Street-Contributing-Brian Oszust, applicant. Do we have a report?

Planning Technician – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As you can see in the packet it has light blue porch railings. They are getting kind of flimsy. Mr. Oszust would like to put wood and black wrought iron. He is going to paint the wood white. The only example is the house next door. He wants to copy that railing style but use wooden posts for good anchoring points to make it sturdier. He is going for approval for a special use permit to turn it into an antique and furniture store.

Chairman Gwaltney – Do we have anyone to speak on the application? Are there any questions or comments?

Mr. Prevatte – Is it required to have 6x6 or 4x4 for the post?

Chairman Gwaltney – I did not see any wooden post with iron rails. I saw a lot of iron rails and wooden rails.

Mr. Prevatte – I was not sure structurally whether the code said 6x6 or 4x4.

Planning Technician – There is nothing about it in regards to building codes.

Mr. Goodrich – I think it is quite an improvement.

Chairman Gwaltney – It is all black and white.

Mr. Prevatte – I think it looks good.

Mr. Goodrich – If you keep the railing blue it is going to continue to flake.

Chairman Gwaltney – Did he mention if he is going to paint the top stoop?

Planning Technician – He didn't mention it.

Chairman Gwaltney – I am assuming that something is going to be done about it.

Planning Technician – His administrative approval was to paint everything the same color. I assume he will paint it the same color but if he changes it then he will have to come before the board.

Mr. Hess – At least it goes with black.

Mr. Hill – I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented.

Mr. Hess – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and property seconded. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, five members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – One of the applicants has some young people with her so that they might get a taste on how this works. We will let them make their presentation and rush home to do homework. We are going to adjust our agenda slightly. Next is Hayden's Lane Park Bench Art Project – Smithfield High School Art Department Students and Jessica Jackman, applicant. Do we have a report?

Planning Technician – I was initially contacted by Mr. Bodson who spoke to me on behalf of Mrs. Jackman. Mr. Bodson informed me that they would like to paint some benches on Hayden's Lane. We asked him to bring us some examples of what it is going to look like. In the packet there is a letter as far as some guidelines and pictures. They would like to take the existing park benches on Hayden's Lane and paint some Isle of Wight County and Smithfield themes on them. They are similar to the pig statues that we see around town.

Chairman Gwaltney – Do we have someone to speak on this application?

Iren O'Donnell – I am here with my fellow classmates Robert Dennis and Aleah Hinkle. I live at 100 James Landing. Mrs. Jackman lives close to Hayden's Lane so she will be able to check the benches for any damage. Some volunteers, parents, and faculty have offered to bring the benches to the school so that we can work on them.

Robert Dennis – I live at Center Street in Carrollton, Virginia. I am here to talk about the history of Hayden's Lane and the sketches that were provided for you. The sketches are actually representation of what we find historically important to downtown Smithfield and the area. Hayden's Lane was originally a driveway to a school in downtown Smithfield. It seems fitting that the students of Smithfield High School would be involved in painting the benches on Hayden's Lane.

Aleah Hinkle – I live at 1190 Eagle Watch. Ms. Shelia Gwaltney who is co-creator of the Smithfield Pigs Project and a staff member from the Isle of Wight County Museum came to teach us a little bit about the history of our town so we could properly create the designs and sketches. We will use weather proof acrylic paint to protect them. Once we receive feedback from our fellow students, peers, administration then we would clear coat the benches with polyethylene. We will need weather proof acrylic and polyethylene on the benches to have a lasting legacy. We have applied for grants which are pending right now.

Robert Dennis – I would like to thank you for your time. I hope that you approve our application to give us our lasting legacy for downtown Smithfield and the Smithfield High School.

Chairman Gwaltney – Thank you for that presentation. Are there any questions or comments?

Mr. Prevatte – I think it is a great idea.

Mr. Goodrich – I see no problem with it. I mean right now they are just plan benches nothing memorable. I think it adds to the attraction of tourism to the town.

Mr. Prevatte – Are there any future artists?

Chairman Gwaltney – They probably all hope to be.

Robert Dennis – This could be our big break.

Mr. Hess – What is the timeline do you anticipate starting the project?

Robert Dennis – I believe we are starting in December.

Mr. Hess – It would be in place before the next big season for tourism.

Chairman Gwaltney – This project has been compared a lot to the pig project. One thing that I feel is very different is there were seven or eight pigs scattered throughout the town. One of the interesting things that rose from the pig project is that not only was it a show case for public art it also became so what of a tourism attraction. I am wondering what the overall appearance and the atmosphere of Hayden's Lane will be with all the multi-colored benches in one place. I am not against public art. I am wondering when you look down the lane is it going to add or detract from the current setting that we have. There have been weddings and receptions held there. I am wondering what is being proposed is going to add to the ambience of that location. You could not paint every bench or paint only where you would touch the bench when you sit down. You would have to be in front or near the bench to see the art work. The sides or the back of the bench could be either painted or stained some other color. So when you look down Hayden's Lane you are not sort of distracted by as much art work.

Mr. Hill – You really cannot see the back of them anyway.

Chairman Gwaltney – The backs are not the big issue. I am looking at the sides. You could concentrate on one picture on the front and not how we tie this in on the sides. I would recommend considering something like that.

Mrs. Jessica Jackman – I live at 204 Gray Street. We would be willing to do that. I think your recommendations make a lot of sense.

Mr. Prevatte – The Simpson Pharmacy had a big mural on the side of the building I thought it was very attractive. I had tourist tell me that they thought it was very attractive. They could have a plaque telling you who it was done by. People will know it was a project from the Smithfield High School students.

Chairman Gwaltney – You are right about the plaques. I can tell what they are trying to say with some of the pictures.

Aleah Hinkle – We are going to do plaques to show case the artist.

Chairman Gwaltney – I think that would be good. It would be nice to have one plaque that says the benches were done by the Smithfield High School students and the other one would have the story of what is on the bench.

Aleah Hinkle – There will be a small plaque near the bench that says the name of the students that worked on the bench and the title is going to be a reflection of what is on the bench for people to see.

Mr. Goodrich – Hayden's Lane may be the only formal location we have in town. I think the painted benches are going to take away a little bit from the formal appearance of Hayden's Lane. I would like to make a motion that we accept the application as presented.

Town Attorney – His motion is to approve the application as presented. You may ask him if he would accept an amendment or you can vote on it. If that fails then you could vote on another motion.

Chairman Gwaltney – Would you accept an amendment to the motion since the applicant has agreed to paint just the front of the benches.

Mr. Goodrich – I will accept that.

Mr. Hill – Are you going to clarify just the front and no backs or the backs and front and no legs?

Chairman Gwaltney – I am saying just the front.

Mr. Goodrich – I don't accept just the front. I thought the discussion earlier was you did not like the sides being painted because that is what you would see going down Hayden's Lane. I agree with you on that but I do not agree with just painting the benches on the front. I think if they carry over to the back there is no problem with that. I will accept something different on the sides.

Mr. Prevatte – I think it is a great idea. I mean it is just paint. It can be painted over.

Chairman Gwaltney – I am sure that is just what they wanted to hear.

Mr. Hess – I think we should amend the motion so that the sides of the benches are consistent. My prospective as a photographer when you are looking down Hayden's Lane I think if the sides of the benches were a consistent color that will give that formal appearance that you are talking about. Then when you walk up to a specific bench you can see the painting and plaque.

Mr. Prevatte – All of it shows the pride they have for the town. I think that speaks for itself.

Chairman Gwaltney – I think that part is great. Would you consider painting the back of it the same color as the legs?

Mrs. Jackman – I think when we originally did the sketches some of the students thought that the front and back would be important. Some of them did the front as being one thing such as downtown at the present and the back would be downtown in the past

so it would show a reflection of that change. However, we will be willing to change it so it just the front. I agree with Mr. Hess that the sides would be the main thing you see especially in photographs.

Town Attorney – He has a motion to approve the application as presented. He is willing to accept a motion but he is not willing to accept your amendment.

Mr. Hill – This would be an amendment to your motion to paint the front and back and leave the legs and sides natural so they will blend with the landscape.

Mr. Hess – Second.

Town Attorney – The motion is to approve as presented with the amendment that the ends will not be painted. They will be left in their natural state as well as the legs and the edges of the benches.

Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and property seconded. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, five members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Mr. Hill – Mr. Reish, you may want to inform the town after they put the benches back they will need to be bolted to the concrete.

Chairman Gwaltney – Good project. We look forward to seeing it done next spring.

Town Attorney – Mr. Reish, I would recommend that you send them a letter confirming exactly what has been approved.

Planning Technician – I was going to say to them that the board action letter would reflect exactly what the motion states.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next item on the agenda is an Addition – 352 South Church Street – Landmark – Joseph Howell, applicant. Do we have a report?

Planning Technician – A couple years ago, Mr. Howell received an approval for an addition. His contractor wanted to get a permit but had some modification to it so we felt it necessary to bring it back to the board. You can see in the packet the elevation drawings. Everything is going to match the existing house. He will be using Hardy-plank siding in the color to match the house. The trim will be AZEK in Colonial White. The roof will be the standing seam galvanized metal roof to match the house. He would like to put the white wooden windows with 9 over 9 grid patterns, some might have 6 over 6.

The railings will be composite white material. If you look at the elevation drawing the only part that you will actually be able to see is where it says new work left elevation. You will be able to get a glimpse of that from South Church Street. The rest of it is heavily wooded.

Chairman Gwaltney – Do we have someone to speak on this application?

Mr. Joseph Howell – I live at 352 South Church Street. We will make sure it matches the rest of the house. All the windows are Anderson windows.

Mr. Prevatte – I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented.

Mr. Goodrich – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and property seconded. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, five members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is a New Construction Single Family Home – Lot 9 Riverview Avenue – No Designation – Kevin Almond and Bruce Firestone, applicants. Do we have a report?

Planning Technician – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Firestone is proposing to build a new construction home on Riverview Avenue. In your packet is a site plan and drawings. He is taking two lots and combining them into one which was administratively approved, recently. The roof will be light brown architectural shingles. The soffit is a tan Hardie Board. The fascia will be a tan PVC. The siding will be Olive color Hardie board/fiber cement clapboard. The windows are off white/cream with 3 over 1 vinyl. The front door will be a craftsman style with a stain wood finish. The front porch will be concrete stained brown/tan with Hardie board wrapped columns and tan AZEK railings. The rear deck will be a tan AZEK decking. The foundation will be cinder block with stucco painted olive to match the siding. There is a revised site plan that shows the required two off street parking spaces. It shows the front porch in better detail as well as the proposed side walk. We are working toward a zoning permit.

Chairman Gwaltney – I assume it meets all the setbacks.

Planning Technician – Yes it meets the setbacks. When he changed the lot from two to one the setback on the sides increased from five feet to ten feet. He has a solid

twelve feet on each side and over twenty-five feet in the front. It is a long ways from the RPA in the back. There is lots of room in the rear yard for possible improvements one day.

Chairman Gwaltney – Do we have someone to speak on this application?

Ms. Susan Milton – I live at 49 Faye Drive, Smithfield.

Mr. Bruce Firestone – I live at 422 Burning Place, Newport News.

Ms. Milton – It is going to add to the Riverview area. There are several really nice new homes. I hope that you will consider approving this application. I have a selfish agenda, I will be selling it.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are there any comments or questions from the board? How much fill dirt for the parking spaces? How is that going to change as far as the proposed entrance walk? How much fill dirt will be around the foundation on the sides?

Mr. Firestone – We have not calculated how many cubic feet of fill dirt we are going to use.

Chairman Gwaltney – I understand that. Are you filling up to the porch level to be able to put a car in there?

Mr. Firestone – Yes. The idea is for it to be level with the walk.

Chairman Gwaltney – How much of the grey will cover the sides of the foundation?

Mr. Firestone – I included a site plan that would show you somewhat what we are going to accomplish.

Planning Technician – It does not show the driveway.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are you going to bury most of the foundation?

Mr. Firestone – Yes. We are going to allow the wall to drop with the grey. We are not going to stack up against it.

Planning Technician – It is not going to cover the foundation of the house because it is too far back.

Mr. Firestone – That is as accurate as we can be at this point.

Chairman Gwaltney – Is it going to be cinder block under the walkway?

Mr. Firestone – No. It is all going to be cinder block with a stucco coating.

Chairman Gwaltney – I am not sure the color of the foundation is the best choice.

Mr. Goodrich – That is the one thing that struck me was the extensive color from the ground to the roof being the same.

Mr. Prevatte – You will have quite a bit of tan to coordinate with it too.

Mr. Firestone – The tan band trim is going around the entire structure which tends to break it up a little bit.

Chairman Gwaltney – Would you consider the foundation being a different color? Maybe brown to look like the color of brick or another color other than the same color green that is on the house.

Mr. Firestone – Yes. Maybe in the same color family but lighter.

Chairman Gwaltney – We are trying to get a color to look like a foundation material like a brick or stone.

Mr. Prevatte – What about grey?

Chairman Gwaltney – It would look like raw cinder block.

Mr. Firestone – We are trying to avoid that.

Chairman Gwaltney – Yes. Looking at the color combination that you have some form of brown comes to mind.

Mr. Firestone – We could entertain a split face block. It is going to give it a little more texture and perhaps a color change as well. The Spearial Wall Company can do certain textures.

Mr. Prevatte – Why are we trying to decide the color for him?

Town Attorney – They are talking about the break between the foundation and the rest of the house.

Mr. Goodrich – It would look better if you had some contrast between the foundation and the house itself.

Chairman Gwaltney – He is proposing a colored block to put on there. I think that is getting closer to what we are trying to get him to do.

Mr. Hess – We had the same discussion about a house on Cox Lane, the foundation was going to be the same color as the siding.

Mr. Hill – Is the foundation space useable as a basement or partial basement?

Mr. Firestone – It will be used as a partial basement.

Mr. Chris Walker – I live at 9 Aeron Drive, Poquoson. I understand if you are looking at the gable end wall if we had one color from the foundation to the roof that would look like one big green wall. As you can see in the picture we are trying to break that up with the bands that he referred to earlier. The tan or cream color bands will make it not look like we are looking a huge green wall. I don't think it is as important on

the front because we have the roof breaking everything up on the front. Definitely on the side I can understand the concern but we are trying to break it up with the bands.

Mr. Firestone – If you are standing in the middle of Riverview looking at the structure you are going to see basically two stories.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are you proposing you might use a cut block for the foundation?

Mr. Firestone – That is a possibility. If you are thinking the stucco in another color would be more appropriate then that is something we can work with as well.

Town Attorney – Mr. Chairman, if you look at page eighty-two in your guidelines on masonry. It says the parging has been used as a coating over brick so certainly it can be used over concrete. It says you should avoid using concrete block. So getting away from the exposed concrete block is something that you are encouraged to do. Stucco is okay. We really do not address cut block it is certainly not the same as standard masonry block.

Mr. Hill – Around each window are you proposing to put a four inch trim?

Mr. Firestone – Yes.

Mr. Hill – The tan PVC that you are talking about using for the fascia is actually a PVC board?

Mr. Firestone – Yes.

Mr. Hess – If you park in the parking area there is no access to the house without going back onto the sidewalk then crossing the bridge into the structure.

Mr. Firestone – That is correct.

Mr. Goodrich – I think the real issue is some color definition on the foundation so that it does not look like you have this one great big solid wall.

Chairman Gwaltney – When do you plan to start breaking ground? Would you start in a month? You probably would not be putting that stucco on the side in a month.

Mr. Firestone – No.

Chairman Gwaltney – If everything is approved on this project with the exception of the color of the foundation would it hold you up from moving forward. Would you be willing to look at a couple of color options and come back next month to let us review the color options with you?

Mr. Firestone – Yes.

Chairman Gwaltney – It is not the material as much as it is the color.

Mr. Hess – I think it is a good proposal.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are there any other questions about the structure?

Mr. Walker – If we said we are okay with just going tan to match the bands and try to match the windows would that be sufficient.

Chairman Gwaltney – It would not be for me. I don't think the tan color is the right color.

Mr. Hess – I think it would be good for them to come back in a month to discuss the color. It gives them time to think about it as well.

Chairman Gwaltney – If you are agreeable to that I have a feeling that it may go through with the exception of that one item.

Mr. Firestone – Okay.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are there any other comments?

Town Attorney – Is there any possibility that we would not have a Board of Historic and Architectural meeting in December? If there is not additional business other than this it can be carried over to January.

Chairman Gwaltney – Gentlemen if we were to go this route with the motion and we did not meet in December would January be okay.

Mr. Firestone – That would be fine.

Chairman Gwaltney – I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented with the amendment that the applicate appear before the board at the next meeting with two or three color options.

Mr. Goodrich – Second.

Planning Technician – We can start on your zoning permit tomorrow provided that it is approved tonight.

Mr. Firestone – Okay

Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and property seconded. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, five members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is Approval of the October 17<sup>th</sup>, 2017 meeting minutes.

Town Attorney – Mr. Chairman and members of the board I recommend the minutes be approved as presented.

Mr. Goodrich – So moved.

Ms. Hill – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and properly seconded. All those in favor signify by saying aye, opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, six members were present. Vice Chair Torre voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, Ms. Hillegass voted aye, and Mr. Prevatte voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Our meeting is adjourned.

The meeting adjourned at 7:32 p.m.

---

Mr. Trey Gwaltney  
Chairman

---

Mr. Joseph Reish  
Planning Technician